

TEACHING RELIGIOUS STUDIES

SERIES EDITOR Karen Y. Jackson-Weaver, Princeton University

> A Publication Series of The American Academy of Religion and Oxford University Press

TEACHING LÉVI-STRAUSS Edited by Hans H. Penner

TEACHING ISLAM Edited by Brannon M. Wheeler

TEACHING FREUD Edited by Diane Jonte-Pace

TEACHING DURKHEIM Edited by Terry F. Godlove, Jr.

TEACHING APRICAN AMERICAN RELIGIONS Edited by Carolyn M. Jones and Theodore Louis Trost

TEACHING RELIGION AND HEALING Edited by Linda L. Barnes and Inés Talamantez

TEACHING NEW RELIGIOUS MOVEMENTS Edited by David G. Bromley

> TEACHING RITUAL Edited by Catherine Bell

TEACHING CONFUCIANISM Edited by Jeffrey L. Richey

TEACHING THE DAODE JING
Edited by Gary Delaney DeAngelis and Warren G.
Frisina

TEACHING RELIGION AND FILM Edited by Gregory J. Watkins

TEACHING DEATH AND DYING Edited by Christopher M. Moreman

TEACHING UNDERGRADUATE RESEARCH IN
RELIGIOUS STUDIES
Edited by Bernadette McNary-Zak and Rebecca Todd
Peters

TEACHING JUNG Edited by Kelly Bulkeley and Clodagh Weldon

TEACHING MYSTICISM Edited by William B. Parsons

Teaching Mysticism

Edited by William B. Parsons

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press, Inc., publishes works that further Oxford University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education.

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Copyright © 2011 by Oxford University Press, Inc.

Published by Oxford University Press, Inc. 198 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016

www.oup.com

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Teaching mysticism / edited by William B. Parsons. p. cm. — (Teaching religious studies series) ISBN 978-0-19-975119-8 1. Mysticism—Study and teaching. I. Parsons, William Barclay, 1955-BL625.T38 2011

204'.22-dc22 2010050578

{ CONTENTS }

		vii
	Contributors	
	Introduction	
	Teaching Mysticism: Frame and Content WILLIAM B. PARSONS	3
	PART I Presenting the Mystical Element: Tradition and Context	
1,	Teaching "Hindu Mysticism" HUGH B. URBAN	· 11
2.	Mysticism Before Mysticism: Teaching Christian Mysticism as a Historian of Religion APRIL DECONICK	26
3.	Teaching Chinese Mysticism LIVIA KOHN	46
4	The Mystical Dimensions of Buddhism DAVID B. GRAY	67
5	. Teaching Islam, Teaching Islamic Mysticism DAVID COOK	88
6	Teaching Jewish Mysticism: Concealing the Concealment and Disclosure of Secrets ELLIOT R. WOLFSON	103
	PART II Negotiating Mysticism: Expanding the Map	
7	7. Chosen by the Spirits: Visionary Ecology and Indigenous Wisdom LEE IRWIN	121
	8. Teaching African American Mysticism JOY R. BOSTIC	138
	9. Teaching Experiential Dimensions of Western Esotericism WOUTER J. HANEGRAAFF	154

{ 2 }

Mysticism Before Mysticism

TEACHING CHRISTIAN MYSTICISM AS A HISTORIAN OF RELIGION

April DeConick

Where does mysticism begin in the Christian tradition? Traditionally it has been conceived to begin in the fifth century with (Pseudo)-Dionysius the Areopagite who taught the *apophatic* way, where the soul escapes the created order to unite with the unknowable God (Louth 1981, 159). So conventional courses in Christian mysticism and the books on which they are based foster the idea that Christian mysticism is a relatively late Platonic and philosophical product of patristic theology. The first generations of Christianity and their foundational memories and narratives are casually brushed aside as "background" to a mysticism arising later, from Christianity's fusion with neo-Platonism (Louth 1981; Cohn-Sherbock and Cohn-Sherbock 1994).

My pedagogical goal is to challenge this understanding of Christian mysticism by tracing the growth of mysticism in early Christianity as a distinctive expression of an already developed tradition of Jewish mysticism. I have named the course appropriately, "Mysticism Before Mysticism." It is a seminar for upper-class undergraduates and graduate students in Religious Studies at Rice University. It meets once a week for fifteen weeks in three-hour sessions.

The seminar progresses diachronically and dialogically, exploring mysticism in Second Temple Judaism and early Christianity, a period prior to the Kabbalah and Dionysius the Areopagite. Materials covered include Jewish and Christian scriptures; pseudepigrapha; Dead Sea Scrolls; and Gnostic, Hermetic, Patristic, neo-Platonic, and Hekhalot literature. Ancient astrological and magical traditions are also discussed.

Primary and secondary readings are assigned for each session. Each week, one student is responsible for leading the discussion by covering the primary materials in review. The other students are responsible for providing an oral overview of one book or set of articles from the required readings for that

among the members of the seminar about the history of Christia and its relationship to Jewish, Egyptian, and Greek expressions of

A Contextual-Comparative Approach

The traditional definition of *mysticism* as it is applied to Christianity (and other religious traditions!) was fashioned from medieval monastic sources. Mysticism within the Christian tradition was identified with the spiritual life of the monk and nun who worked to purify their souls of darkness. Eventually, they undergo a spiritual death and upward journey to unite with a god who is described as "love" (cf. Underhill 1911; Egan 1991, xvi–xxv). This framing of the subject has resulted in privileging the monastic devotional experiences and practices, at the expense of other forms of mysticism.

Consequently, the problem of definition does not just involve semantics. It also involves comparativism and the distortion of history that can result when the point of comparison is not selected carefully. When historians of Christianity developed the language of mysticism, it was done with the medieval Christian monastic descriptions of immediate and direct contact with the divine as the yardstick. So mysticism became analogous to the experience of the monastic devotee. If this later developed concept becomes the point of comparison for the earlier period, then the earlier period becomes "background" with no mysticism to be found within it. This approach values and privileges the Christian monastic experience while failing to recognize the existence of mysticism in the earlier period.

So the problem of definition is not simply an academic exercise that I discuss with my students to launch my course. It is a question with profound implications, because the definitions we impose on our subject ultimately determine what we see and what we take away with us from that experience. If our definition of Christian mysticism is what medieval Christian mystics relate, involving a *unio mystica*, then Paul was not a mystic, nor was Jesus or any of Jesus's Jewish contemporaries. Christian mysticism, in fact, would begin with (Pseudo-)Dionysius the Areopagite, as the historical introductions to Christian mysticism suggest. The same problem can be tracked in the secondary literature about Jewish mysticism, which is conventionally defined from the point of view of the later Kabbalah, so that in the earlier centuries, Judaism is devoid of mysticism.

Yet, from the beginning, Christianity understood itself as a "revealed" religion, as a religion that was not only disclosed through direct and immediate divine-to-human communication, but whose dogma reveals to humans the hidden God and his will. With this self-identity, mysticism can scarcely be far away. Although it is true that a particular strand of Christianity fused with neo-Platonism produced the type of mysticism taught and practiced by

(Pseudo)-Dionysius, it is also true that long before (Pseudo)-Dionysius lived, there was a rich tradition of Christian mysticism already in place, a mysticism that grew out of even older Jewish mystical traditions as I have described elsewhere. It was this Christian brand of early Jewish mysticism that eventually yielded a pliable branch for a neo-Platonic graft to take hold, such as it did in the teachings of (Pseudo-)Dionysius.

So what are we to do? I suggest a three-fold solution. By making these three shifts in approach, the discussion will no longer privilege the later monastic sacred experiences and route to the divine, but it will open up the exploration so that the texts of the early Christian period, rather than the conventional definition, will be allowed to circumscribe the specifics of the phenomenon.

First, I recommend beginning by working from a flexible understanding of mysticism that transcends cultural and historical relativism, such as mysticism is the solicitation and participation in a direct immediate experience of the ultimate reality. I would distinguish mysticism from the mystical experience itself, which is the direct immediate experience of the ultimate reality solicited or not. Working with this type of definition as a starting point has the advantage of controlling the problem of privileging certain religious traditions and their practices over others.

Second, to avoid the imposition of later developed views of mysticism on the earlier period, I suggest that we shift our point of comparison to the study of traditions closest to the early Christian texts, to move the discussion of mysticism to the materials that were produced by the Jews and Christians during the formative years of their religions. Christianity in this period is a form of Judaism that is beginning to self-identify as an entity distinct from Judaism. Even more complicated is the fact that Judaism is in its own process of self-definition in this same period. What we have is a situation in which two competing religions are emerging simultaneously, while claiming allegiance to a common scripture and history. Although Christianity eventually self-identifies as a distinct religion, its scripture, ideologies, and practices remain connected to its sibling through its common scripture and history. So to speak about early Christian mysticism means that it is impossible to talk about it without reference to Jewish traditions. Jewish mysticism and Christian mysticism are two sides of a single coin.

I have found that to study early Christian mysticism successfully, the Christian story needs to be integrated with the Jewish story. It is most enlightening when the course includes the study of Jewish and Christian materials simultaneously so that the one informs the other. This approach will not only identify certain characteristics of early mysticism held in common by the Jews and Christians, but it will also allow the students to identify those characteristics that are unique to Christian mysticism. Common features include a priestly cosmology based on foundational Jewish texts, particularly but not exclusively

centerpiece of this cosmology is the belief that God has a "body," called the "Glory" or *Kavod* of YHWH that could be viewed. The celestial realm was perceived to be the heavenly equivalent of the Jerusalem temple (and vice versa). The heavens themselves are *hekhalot*, shrine rooms or sanctuaries within the temple. The highest heaven is the holy of holies where the Glory resides, seated on the *merkavah*, the throne-chariot. Certain communities of Jews and Christians thought that it was possible for "prepared" humans to enter these sacred zones even before their deaths in order to participate in heavenly worship or to glance upon the Glory. This process often resulted in their transformation, for instance, when they would become "glorified," "exalted," or "angelic." These journeys were often solicited through "ritual" speech, hymning, asceticism, dream incubation, or participation in special liturgies.

In terms of distinct features of early Christian mysticism, the Glory is identified with Jesus Christ. Because of this, the mysticism of early Christianity is strikingly Christocentric. It focuses on the "revelation of Jesus Christ," which is understood to be the disclosure of the mystery that has been hidden with God for the ages. This mystery is Jesus Christ as the Power and the Glory of God. The other unique feature of early Christian mysticism is the belief that all Christians experience this revelation. The experience was made "democratic" through a series of initiation and communal rituals, beginning with baptism when the Christ indwelled the initiate as the Spirit. The Christ/Spirit is regularly experienced in the life of the community and the other sacraments, particularly the Eucharist, where Jesus Christ is consumed by the faithful and thus taken directly into their bodies. This revelation of Jesus Christ results in (apo)theosis, where the believer morphs into Christ as God's image and (eventually) achieves the "lot" of immortality.

Third, I use a second point of comparison, carefully chosen, to provide further context and dialogical insight: contemporaneous non-Jewish and non-Christian traditions within the same cultural and historical locations, such as Greek mystery religions and neo-Platonic traditions. This comparative group helps us distinguish unique features of Jewish and Christian mysticism. At the same time, studying this data set allows us to see how the Greek ideas and practices become integrated into the Christian mystical tradition. From this, the integration can be mapped.

The Social Dynamic

Mysticism even within the "same" religious tradition may look very different in different social contexts. For example, the liturgies and mystical practices put into place by the Dead Sea Jews who "imaginatively" entered the heavenly tabernacle as a community of "angels" through the verbalization of Sabbath liturgies are quite distinct from the shamanistic practices of the Hekhalot Jews

who individually descended to the chariot. The Gnostic Christian who rehearsed the names of the archons and underwent multiple baptisms and anointings in order to ascend out of this universe is doing something different from the Catholic Christian who undergoes a one-time initiatory baptism for his or her redemption. Even though all these groups reference similar themes (e.g., temple, glorification, gods of light, celestial beings, visions, ascents, angelification, spirit possession) and practices (e.g., water and anointing rituals, scriptural study, prayers, liturgies, incantations, hymning), the way in which these themes and practices emerge and develop within specific social contexts are strikingly different and idiosyncratic. When examining the historical development of mysticism, the social dimension and group dynamics cannot be overemphasized.

This appears to me to be a straightforward historical observation that does not require extensive philosophical discussion. So I am consistently asking my students to be aware of geographical, chronological, social, and cultural contexts of the historical and literary data and to map these as the course unfolds. I probe my students to consider the history of a specific group and to try to reconstruct group dynamics whenever possible. How do particular social dynamics affect the development of mysticism within that context? Who are the author's dialogue partners? What do we discover when we read the text against the grain?

In this way, the course challenges students to think not only in dialogical terms, but it asks students to read texts as a repository of a group's memory of the growth of its traditions. Students are made aware of the interactive and responsive nature of religious traditions. As they study different texts and the groups that created them, they begin to see that hermeneutics shift, meanings flip, and ideas invert as memories and traditions are passed along generationally and become part of a "new" group's cognitive reservoir.⁵

I have found that mysticism in the early Christian period develops a common "core." It is Christocentric, understanding the goal to be a vision of Christ or an experience of possession where Christ's spirit enters the person and "abides" within. Christ is perceived to be the Glory of God, the manifestation of the father God. This is the hidden secret of the eternal ages. The Christian mystical praxis involves water, oil, and eating rituals, as well as hymning, prayers, incantations, studying scriptures, and participating in liturgies. I cannot emphasize enough how central the Temple is to the mysticism that the early Christians develop. They understand their invasion of the celestial realms to be the journey of a priest into the sacred rooms of the Temple.

Clearly the mysticism that the early Christians develop is part of a coherent conversation that engages Judaism and certain Egyptian and Hellenistic traditions from the same period. Whether this identifiable "core" is comparable across a wider religious and chronological data set is beyond the scope of this across a wider religious and chronological data set is beyond the scope of this

that transcends culture, is a question that requires a more thorough philosophical discussion, should this become one of the goals of the course.

Empathic Reading

The contextual-comparative approach means that the students ought to be made aware of the necessity placed on historians to consciously distance ourselves from *etic* definitions. *Etic* definitions are those that we impose on our subject. Because they are secondary and can grossly distort the subject by misunderstanding and misrepresenting it, we must continually evaluate those *etic* definitions that do inform our thinking. Whenever possible, students ought to read the ancient texts on their own grounds and dialogically, that is, in relation to each other. They should attempt to assume the worldview of the ancient Jew and Christian, and read out the ancient *emic* understandings of the mystical whenever possible. What do the ancient people tell us about their own framings of the mystical?

Such an approach means that I am asking students to no longer be complete strangers to the old textual traditions, but to enter into them, to assume them for a moment, and to look at the world through the author's eyes. This is a precarious position for the historian, to be neither an insider nor an outsider, but to adopt a liminal view as an interloper. It is the position that emerges from empathy, rather than sympathy or antipathy. This position, however, should not be perceived as one that collapses critical distance. The historian should never be an apologist. Nevertheless, it is necessary to enter the "mind" of the authors in order to appreciate and understand what these texts have to say about the subject. To accomplish this successfully, students will need to be trained in ancient worldviews and belief systems as different texts are assigned and discussed.

What the student discovers from empathic reading is that the ancient Christians do not favor the word *mysticism* and its cognates, which derive from the Greek word *myeô*, "to be initiated." Although they do sometimes speak of the revelation of "mysteries" or "divine secrets" (*mystêria*), the first Christians call their direct immediate pre-mortem experiences of God "apocalypses" (*apocalypseis*) or "revelations." They write about these revelations as "rapture" events as well as "solicited" events for which they prepare through a prescribed praxis. They speak of the events as waking visions, dreams, trances, and auditions, conceiving of them as events that often involved spirit possession and ascent journeys. The development of the sacraments (*mystêria*), baptism, and the Eucharist resulted in the democratization of the mystical. They were the moments in the life of the faithful when Christ and/or the Spirit were encountered and embodied, and (progressive) transfiguration resulted. But in this early period, the transfiguration is not described by them in terms of the *unio mystica* of

medieval mysticism. Rather it is perceived to be a transformative event, which, for example, delivered heavenly knowledge, or resulted in membership in the angelic choir, or enthronement, or a shining glorified body. In this way, the mystic's sacred transformation reflects the hopes and promises of the Eschaton, the conventional moment of bodily transfiguration and paradisial rewards. This is a Jewish story, not the Platonic one in which the hope was very different: the reunification of the immortal soul with the One, the Good.

What about Religious Experience?

As historians who study mysticism, we are plagued with the problem of religious experience. Put simply, in-and-of-itself religious experience cannot be studied from a historical-critical perspective. This problem has led to a disturbing undercurrent in our discussions, an undercurrent that hinders our investigation. Scholars have become divided over whether texts that relate stories of mystical experiences and practices assume genuine mystical experiences and practices or not. If not, what do they represent? Creative imagination? Hallucination? Trickery? Exegetical gymnastics?

It is unfortunate that scholars have structured their analyses along these lines. By doing so, the veracity of religious experience (something that cannot be empirically observed or described) has overwhelmed and impeded our otherwise critical conversation. I imagine that this argument was originally generated to offer a rational explanation for the irrational. Because the supernatural does not exist in modernity, some scholars tried to account for the ancient descriptions of mystical experience in rational ways, as hallucinations or exegetical enterprise. But this move to dismiss the "supernatural" conversation by rationalizing it has not increased our knowledge of ancient mysticism, although it does speak to modern perceptions that mysticism cannot exist.

The problem of modern mysticism—that the mystical experience cannot exist—appears to me to factor into the philosophical discussions and the contemporary constructivist approaches of Steven Katz (1978) and Wayne Proudfoot (1985) who take issue with the classical view that there is some pure ineffable experience that is described in a variety of fashions by a variety of mystics. Katz argues that there is no pure unmediated experiences because all our experiences are processed and shaped by our ways of knowing, and these are culturally derivative and dependent. Even similarly described experiences may reflect very different experiences. Proudfoot argues that the prevailing religious traditions create and simultaneously interpret the religious experiences of the mystics. The ineffable, he says, cannot be communicated (1985, 126). I wonder about these approaches. Should the different cultural manifestations of mysticism be used to challenge the veracity of the mystical experiences.

does not recognize the veracity of mystical experience due to its connection to the supernatural. Although we might be able to plainly see that mysticism looks the same and different across cultures and times, and that all experiences are processed or perceived, it is quite another to conclude from this that pure mystical experience does not exist or cannot be communicated.

My historical solution to the problem is simple. It involves two straightforward observations. First, because the ancient people we are studying had a profound belief in the reality of the supernatural, we will learn more about their understandings of mysticism if we allow the supernatural to continue to exist for them. In other words, whether or not any of their claims to religious experience represent genuine encounters with God is a discussion that misses the historical-critical point. Our prime observation ought to concern the perceptions of the ancient people themselves, something that we can empirically recover from the literature.

The ancient people who read the scriptures and para-biblical texts that described the mystical journeys and experiences of the ancestors and heroes believed that these texts reported actual experiences with God. The same can be said about those who, such as Paul or John of Patmos or Hermas, wrote about their mystical experiences. The scriptures and para-biblical texts served as templates for their own mystical hopes, dreams, and practices. Study of the texts and their exegesis became integral to the development of their mystical practices. The images in these texts deeply affected the way in which the early Christians described and interpreted their own experiences.

This takes us to my second observation that a distinction ought to be made between "religious experience" and "religiously interpreted experience" (Segal 2006, 27–40). The former cannot be empirically known or observed. The latter can. I can never know whether or not John of Patmos saw a glorious angel, one like a son of man, with hair white as wool and eyes like fire, and if he did, whether or not Daniel 7 influenced his vision (Revelation 1:12–16). What I can discuss, however, is how and why John of Patmos interpreted his experience (whatever it may have been) to be an experience with great religious significance, even comparable to the vision of Daniel related in the scripture. I can discuss how this frame served John's purposes and what it might tell me about John's religious location, ideology, and expectations.

When the problem of religious experience is reframed in terms of "religiously interpreted experience," the door swings open for critical analysis, especially given the fact that it is the religious community that controls the hermeneutical process rather than the individual. It is the community that ultimately decides whether an individual's experience represents an "authentic" mystical encounter or not. If so, the community will shape the retelling of the experience to meet its criteria for authenticity and religious legitimacy. If not, the experience is cast as a demonic encounter or one with no religious

34

Course Delivery and Syllabus

Given the way in which I have schematized the subject, I have found that the most successful approach is the adoption of a chronological approach. This allows the Jewish, Christian, and other ancient religious materials to overlap in terms of content delivery and hermeneutic. This provides an optimal comparative lens as well as historical contextualization and localization. Jewish and Christian forms of mysticism can be discussed in relationship to each other and successfully compared with other contemporaneous religious traditions. The following syllabus represents a generic syllabus along with some suggestions for readings. Although the primary readings are stable, the secondary readings are more flexible and should be altered to fit the goals of the particular course. I include in the syllabus those secondary readings that I consider essential or classic, references that students will come across consistently in the scholarly discussions of the subject.

Christian mysticism can be studied from a historical-critical perspective and successfully taught from the point of view of the historian of religion. It is a rich and rewarding field, and an emerging field at that. Reframing the definition of mysticism with an eye toward the *emic*, shifting the point of comparison to literature contemporaneous with the early Christian, and reading empathically with a social orientation reveals a rich tradition of Christian mysticism in the foundational period. This mysticism reflects the Jewish story, not the Greek one. It becomes the ground for Platonic ideas about a union with the One to take root and develop later into the more familiar monastic expression of Christian mysticism. But that is a story for another class.

Syllabus

Week 1: What Is Mysticism?

- 1.1 Primary literature: Genesis 1-3; Exodus 24 and 33; Ezekiel 1, 8, 10, and 40-48; Isaiah 6; Daniel 7; 1 Chronicles 28:18.
- 1.2 Secondary literature: DeConick (2006), 1–24; Segal (2006), 27–40; Rowland, Gibbons, and Dobroruka (2006), 41–56; Sanders (2006), 57–79.

Week 2: Early Jewish Pseudepigrapha

2.1 Primary literature: Charlesworth (1983–1985): 1 Enoch, 2 Enoch, Ezekiel the Tragedian, Ascension of Isaiah, Joseph and Aseneth, Life of Adam and Eve, History of the Rechabites, Apocalypse of Abraham, Apocalypse of Adam, Testament of Levi, Apocalypse of Zephaniah, 3 Baruch

2.2 Secondary literature: Boustan and Reed (2004); Davila (2006), 105–126; Dean-Otting (1984); Flannery-Dailey (2006), 231–248; Fossum (1999), 348–352; Halperin (1988a), 47–67; Himmelfarb (1993); Morray-Jones (1992), 1–31; Orlov (2007); Rowland (1979), 145–150, and (1982); Segal (1980), 1333–1394; Stone (1976), 414–451.

Week 3: Philo of Alexandria

- 3.1 Primary literature: Winston (1981): On the Contemplative Life, the Giants, and "selections" from Philo.
- 3.2 Secondary Literature: Borgen (1997); Chadwick (1966), 286-307; Deutsch (2006), 287-312; Goodenough (1969); Smith (1968), 315-326; Winston (1981), 1-37, and (1982), 15-39.

Week 4: Hermetic Literature, Magic, and Astrology

- 4.1 Primary literature: Copenhaver (1992), Corpus Hermeticum,
 Asclepius; Scott (1993), Extracts of Stobaeus; Robinson (1988),
 Discourse on the Eigth and Ninth, Prayer of Thanksgiving, Asclepius
 fragment; Meyer and Smith (1994); Salaman et al. (2000), The
 Definitions of Hermes Trismegistus to Asclepius; Betz (1992).
- 4.2 Secondary literature: Barton (1994); Bohak (2008); Van den Broek and Van Heertum (2000); Van den Broek and Hanegraaff (1998); Fowden (1986); Segal (1981), 349–375; Von Stuckrad (2000a) and (2000b), 1–40; Trachtenberg (1974).

Week 5: Dead Sea Scrolls

- 5.1 Primary literature: García Martínez (1994).
- 5.2 Secondary literature: Davila (2000), 249–264; Dimant (1996), 93–103; Dimant and Strugnell (1990), 331–348; Elior (2006), 83–104; Fletcher-Louis (2002); Morray-Jones (2006), 145–178; Newsom (1985), 1–83; Popovic (2007); Schiffman (1982), 14–47; Smith (1990); Schäfer (2006), 37–66; Strugnell (1960), 318–345; Wolfson (1994a), 185–202, and (2003), 177–215.

Week 6: Synoptic Gospels, Acts, Johannine Literature, Thomasine literature

- 6.1 Primary literature: Mark, Matthew, Luke-Acts, John, 1 and 2 John;
 Robinson (1988), Gospel of Thomas, Dialogue of the Savior, Book of
 Thomas the Contender; Elliott (1993), Acts of Thomas.
- 6:2 Secondary literature: Barker (1995a) and (1995b), 31–67; Daniélou (1962); DeConick (1996,, 2005, 2011); Fletcher-Louis (1997); Fossum (1995); Hurtado (2000), 183–205; Johnson (1998); Kanagaraj (1998); Odeberg (1974); Rowland and Morray-Jones (2009); Smith (1981), 403–429.

Week 7: Pauline and Deutro-Pauline Literature

7.1 Primary literature: Paul's letters, Colossians, and Ephesians.

7.2 Secondary literature: Ashton (2000); Bowker (1971), 157–173; Francis (1975), 163–195; Gieschen (1998); Morray-Jones (1993a), 177–217, and (1993b), 265–292; Segal (1990), 34–71; Schäfer (1984), 19–35; Schweitzer (1998); Tabor (1986).

Week 8: Hebrews, Revelation, Shepherd of Hermas, Montanists

8.1 Primary literature: Hebrews, Revelation, Shepherd of Hermas

8.2 Secondary literature: Afzael (2006), 195–210, and (2008); Aune (1983); Barker (2007); Bauckham (1993); Draper (1983), 113–147; Gieschen (2003), 115–158, and (2006), 341–354; Rowland (1980), 1–11; Tabbernee (2007).

Week 9: The Mystery Religions

9.1 Primary Literature: Grant (1953); Meyer (1987).

9.2 Secondary Literature: Beck (2006); Burkert (1987); Kerényi (1976); Mylonas (1969); Reitzenstein (1978); Ulansey (1989); Witt (1971).

Week 10: Second and Early Third Century Gnostics

10.1 Primary literature: Robinson (1988), Valentinian (Prayer of the Apostle Paul, Gospel of Truth, Treatise on the Resurrection, Tripartite Tractate, Gospel of Philip, 1 Apocalypse of James, Exegesis on the Soul, Interpretation of Knowledge, A Valentinian Exposition, Gospel of Mary), and Sethian (Apocryphon of John, Hypostasis of the Archons, Gospel of the Egyptians, Apocalypse of Adam, Three Steles of Seth, Zostrianos, Melchizedek, Thought of Norea, Marsanes, Allogenes, Hypsiphrone, Trimorphic Protennoia). DeConick (2007), translation of the Gospel of the Judas.

10.2 Secondary literature: DeConick (2007), 26–46, (2001a), 225–261, and (2003), 307–342; Deutsch (1995, 1999); Fossum (1985); Gruenwald (1988); Mastrocinque (2005); Morray-Jones (2002), 138–172; Quispel (1980), 1–13, and (1992), 1–19; Stroumsa (1996), 46–62; Wolfson (2007), 234–271.

Week 11: Alexandrian Fathers: Clement and Origen

11.1 Primary literature: Anti-Nicene Fathers, writings of Clement of Alexandria and Origen

11.2 Secondary literature: Barker (2003); Bucur (2006), 251–268; Chadwick (1954), 15–39; Christman (2005); Dillon (1996); Halperin (1981), 261–275; Lilla (1971); Roberts (1979); Stroumsa (1996),

Week 12: Plotinus and Neo-Platonism

12.1 Primary literature: Enneads

12.2 Secondary Literature: Bussanich (1988), (1994), 5300-5330, and (1997), 339-365; Dillon (1986), 55-70, and (2002), 278-295; Dodds (1986), 230-249; Jonas (1969), 315-329; Kenney (1997), 315-337; Meijer (1992), 294-333; Rist (1964); Majercik (1995), 38-61; Thesleff (1980), 101-114; Wallis, (1976), 121-153, and (1986), 460-480.

Week 13: Hekhalot Literature

- 13.1 Primary literature: Charlesworth 1983–1985, 3 Enoch; Janowitz 1989, Maaseh Merkavah; Smith 1963, 142–160, Hekhalot Rabbati; Schäfer 1991–1995, German translation of Hekhalot literature.
- 13.2 Secondary literature: Arbel (2003); Chernus (1982), 123–146; Dan (1986), 289–307; Elior (1993/1994), 3–53, and (1997), 217–267; Gruenwald (1973), 63–107, and (1980); Halperin (1988a); Himmelfarb (1988), 73–100; Lesses (1988); Morray-Jones (2002); Orlov (2005); Schäfer (1992) and (2009); Scholem (1955), 1–79, and (1960); Swartz (1996); Wolfson (1994b), 13–187.

Weeks 14-15: Student Research Presentations

Notes

1. Although McGinn does not wish to neglect the Jewish origins of Christian mysticism, his treatment of the Jewish materials hinges on fourteen pages before turning to a discussion of the Greek materials and never looking back: McGinn (1992, 9–22). In part, this minimal treatment may be due to the definition of mysticism generated by McGinn, which views mysticism as a "part" of a religion (following Friedrick Baron von Hügel). It reflects a "way of life" as well as the mystical experience of God's presence, abandoning the idea of "union" in favor of "presence" (following Joseph Maréchal). McGinn states that his definition was borne from close readings of the texts that have been accepted as mystical classics in the history of Christianity (McGinn 1992, xv-xx).

- 2. For a treatment of the major characteristics of early Jewish and Christian mysticism, see DeConick (2006, 1-24).
 - 3. For an overview of common features, see DeConick (2006, 1-24).
 - 4. On these unique features, see DeConick (2011).
 - 5. On this approach to tradition-history, see DeConick (2005, 3-37).

Bibliography

Afzael, Cameron C. 2006. "Wheels of Time in the Apocalypse of Jesus Christ." In DeConick (2006), 195-210.

- _____. 2008. The Mystery of the Book of Revelation: Reenvisioning the End of Time. Lewiston: Mellon.
- Arbel, Daphna. 2003. Beholders of Divine Secrets: Mysticism and Myth in the Hekhalot and Merkavah Literature. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Ashton, John. 2000. The Religion of Paul the Apostle. New Haven, CT: Yale University.
- Aune, David E. 1983. Prophecy in Early Christianity and the Ancient Mediterranean World. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans.
- Barker, Margaret. 1995a. On Earth as It Is in Heaven: Temple Symbolism in the New Testament. Edinburgh: T&T Clark.
- . 1995b. "The Secret Tradition," Journal of Higher Criticism 2/1 (Spring, 1995), 31-67.
- _____. 2003. The Great High Priest: The Temple Roots of Christian Liturgy. London: T&T Clark.
- _____. 2007. The Hidden Tradition of the Kingdom of God. London: SPCK Publishing.
- Barton, Tamsyn. 1994. Ancient Astrology. New York: Routledge.
- Bauckham, Richard. 1993. The Climax of Prophecy: Studies on the Book of Revelation. Edinburgh: T&T Clark.
- Beck, Roger. 2006. The Religion of the Mithras Cult in the Roman Empire: Mysteries of the Unconquered Sun. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Betz, Hans Dieter, ed. 1992. The Greek Magical Papyri in Translation. Vol. 1. Rev. ed. Chicago: University of Chicago.
- Bohak, Gideon. 2008. Ancient Jewish Magic. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Borgen, Peder. 1997. Philo of Alexandria: An Exegete for His Time. Novum Testamentum Supplement 86. Leiden: Brill.
- Boustan, Ra'anan, and Annette Yoshiko Reed. 2004. Heavenly Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religions. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bowker, J. W. 1971. "'Merkavah' Visions and the Visions of Paul," Journal of Semitic Studies 16: 157-173.
- Broek, Roelof van den, and Wouter J. Hanegraaff, eds. 1998. Gnosis and Hermeticism from Antiquity to Modern Times. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Broek, Roelof van den, and Cis van Heertum. Editors. 2000. From Poimandres to Jacob Böhme: Gnosis, Hermetism and the Christian Tradition. Amsterdam: Bibliotheca Philosophica Hermetica.
- Bucur, Bogdan G. 2006. "The Other Clement of Alexandria: Cosmic Hierarchy and Interiorized Apocalypticism," Vigiliae Christianae 60: 251–268.
- Burkert, Walter. 1987. Ancient Mystery Cults. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Bussanich, J. 1988. The One and Its Relation to Intellect in Plotinus. Leiden: Brill.
- ———. 1994. "Mystical Elements in the Thought of Plotinus," Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt 2 (36.7): 5300–5330.
- . 1997. "Plotinian Mysticism in Theoretical and Comparative Perspective," American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly 71 (3): 339–365.
- Chadwick, Henry, ed. 1954. Alexandrian Christianity. Philadelphia: Westminster.
- _______. 1966. "St. Paul and Philo of Alexandria," Bulletin of the John Rylands Library 48: 286-307.

- Charlesworth, James H., ed. 1983–1985. The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha. 2 vol. Garden City, NJ: Doubleday.
- Chernus, Ira. 1982. "Visions of God in Merkavah Mysticism," Journal for the Study of Judaism 8: 123–146.
- Christman, Angela Russell. 2005. "What Did Ezekiel See?" Christian Exegesis of Ezekiel's Vision of the Chariot from Irenaeus to Gregory the Great. Leiden: Brill.
- Cohn-Sherbok, Dan, and Lavinia Cohn-Sherbok. 1994. Jewish and Christian Mysticism: An Introduction. New York: Continuum.
- Copenhaver, Brian P., ed. 1992. Hermetica. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Dan, Joseph. 1986. "The Religious Experience of the Merkavah." In Jewish Spirituality from the Bible through the Middle Ages, edited by Arthur Green, 289~307. New York: Crossroad.
- Daniélou, J. 1962. "Les Traditions Secretes des Apôtres," Eranos-Jahrbuch 31: 199-215.
- Davila, James R. 2000. "The Dead Sea Scrolls and Merkavah Mysticism." In *The Dead Sea Scrolls in Their Historical Context*, edited by Timothy H. Lim, Larry W. Hurtado, and A. Graeme Auld, 249–264. Edinburgh: T&T Clark.
- . 2006. "The Ancient Jewish Apocalypses and the Hekhalot Literature." In DeConick (2006), 105–126.
- Dean-Otting, Mary. 1984. Heavenly Journeys: A Study of the Motif in Hellenistic Jewish Literature. Judentum und Umwelt 8. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- DeConick, April D. 1996. Seek to See Him: Ascent and Vision Mysticism in the Gospel of Thomas. Leiden: Brill.
- . 2001a. "The True Mysteries: Sacramentalism in the Gospel of Philip," Vigiliae Christianae 55: 225–261.
- . 2001b. Voices of the Mystics: Early Christian Discourse in the Gospels of John and Thomas and Other Ancient Christian Literature. Sheffield: Sheffield University Press.
- . 2003. "The Great Mystery of Marriage: Sex and Conception in Ancient Valentinian Traditions," Vigiliae Christianae 57: 307-342.
- . 2005. Recovering the Original Gospel of Thomas. London: T&T Clark.
- . 2006. "What Is Early Jewish and Christian Mysticism?" In *Paradise Now: Essays on Early Jewish and Christian Mysticism*, edited by April D. DeConick. Symposium 11, 1–24. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature.
- 2007. The Thirteenth Apostle: What the Gospel of Judas Really Says. New York: Continuum.
- . 2011. "Jesus Revealed: The Dynamics of Early Christian Mysticism." In With Letter of Light: Studies in the Dead Sea Scrolls, Early Jewish Apocalypticism, Magic, and Mysticism in Honor of Rachel Elior, edited by Daphna Arbel and Andrei Orlov, 299–324. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Deutsch, Celia. 2006. "The Therapeutae, Text Work, Ritual, and Mystical Experience." In De-Conick (2006), 287–312.
- Deutsch, Nathaniel. 1995. The Gnostic Imagination: Gnosticism, Mandaeism, and Merkabah Mysticism. Leiden: Brill.
- . 1999. Guardians of the Gate: Angelic Vice Regency in Late Antiquity. Leiden: Brill. Dillon, J. 1986. "Plotinus and the Transcendental Imagination." In Religious Imagination, edited by J. P. Mackey, 55–70. Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press.

- . 1996. The Middle Platonists, 80 B.C. to A.D. 220. Rev. ed. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- . 2002. "The Platonic Philosopher at Prayer." In Metaphysik und Religion: zur Signatur des spätantiken Denkens. Akten des internationalen Kongresses vom 13.-17. März 2001 in Würzburg, edited by T. Kobusch and M. Erler, 278-295. Munich: K. G. Saur.
- Dimant, Devorah, and John Strugnell. 1990. "The Merkavah Vision in Second Ezekiel (4Q385 4)," Revue de Qumrân 4: 331-348.
- Dimant, Devorah. 1996. "Men as Angels: The Self-Image of the Qumran Community." In Religion and Politics in the Ancient Near East, edited by Adele Berlin, 93-103. Potomac: University Press of Maryland.
- Dodds, E. R. 1986. "Neoplatonist Spirituality I: Plotinus and Porphyry." In Classical Mediterranean Spirituality: Egyptian, Greek, Roman, edited by A. H. Armstrong, 230–249. New York: Crossroad.
- Draper, Jonathan. 1983. "The Heavenly Feast of Tabernacles: Revelation 7.1-17," Journal of the Study of the New Testament 9: 113-147.
- Egan, Harvey D. 1991. An Anthology of Christian Mysticism. Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press.
- Elior, Rachel. 1993/1994. "Mysticism, Magic, and Angelology: The Perception of Angels in Hekhalot Literature," Jewish Studies Quarterly 1: 3-53.
- ------ 1997. "From Earthly Temple to Heavenly Shrines," Jewish Studies Quarterly 4: 217-267.
- _____. 2006. "The Emergence of the Mystical Traditions of the Merkavah." In DeConick (2006), 83-104.
- Elliott, J. K., ed. 1993. The Apocryphal New Testament. Oxford; Clarendon.
- Flannery-Dailey, Frances. 2006. "Lessons on Early Jewish Apocalypticism and Mysticism from Dream Literature." In DeConick (2006), 231-248.
- Fletcher-Louis, Crispin H. T. 1997. Luke-Acts: Angels, Christology and Soteriology. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 2: 94. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- . 2002. All the Glory of Adam: Liturgical Anthropology in the Dead Sea Scrolls. Studies of the Texts of the Desert of Judah 42. Leiden: Brill.
- Fossum, Jarl E. 1985. The Name of God and the Angel of the Lord. Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 36. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- ______. 1995. The Image of the Invisible God: Essays on the Influence of Jewish Mysticism on Early Christology. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- _____. 1999. "Glory." In Dictionary of Deities and Demons in the Bible, 2nd ed., edited by Karel van der Toorn, Bob Becking, Pieter W. van der Horst, 348–352. Leiden: Brill.
- Fowden, Garth. 1986. The Egyptian Hermes: A Historical Approach to the Late Pagan Mind. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Francis, Fred O. 1975. "Humility and Angelic Veneration in Col 2:18." In Conflict at Colossae, edited by Fred. O. Francis and Wayne A. Meeks, 163-195. Missoula: Scholars Press.
- García Martínez, Florentino, ed. 1994. The Dead Sea Scrolls Translated: The Qumran Texts in English. Leiden: Brill.
- Gieschen, Charles. 1998. Angelomorphic Christology: Antecedents and Early Evidence. Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums (AGJU) 42. Leiden: Brill. Nicana Christology" Vioiliae Christianae 57

- -----. 2006. "Baptismal Praxis and Mystical Experience in the Book of Revelation." In De-Conick (2006), 341-354.
- Goodenough, Erwin R. 1969. By Light, Light: The Mystic Gospel of Hellenistic Judaism. Amsterdam: Philo Press,
- Grant, Frederick C., ed. 1953. Hellenistic Religions: The Age of Sycretism. New York: The WW Liberal Arts Press.
- Gruenwald, Ithamar. 1973. "Knowledge and Vision: Towards a Clarification of Two 'Gnostic' Concepts in the Light of Their Alleged Origins," Israel Oriental Studies 3: 63-107.
- . 1980. Apocalyptic and Merkavah Mysticism. AGJU 14. Leiden: Brill.

Mysticism Before Mysticism

- ______. 1988. From Apocalyptic to Gnosticism. Beitrage zur Erfarschung des Alten Testaments und des antiken Judentums 14. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- Halperin, David. 1981. "Origen, Ezekiel's Merkabah and the Ascension of Moses," Church History 50: 261-275.
- -. 1988a. "Ascension or Invasion: Implications of the Heavenly Journey in Ancient Judaism," Religion 18: 47-67.
- -----. 1988b. Faces of the Chariot: Early Jewish Responses to Ezekiel's Vision. Texte und Studien zum Antiken Judentum 6. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- Himmelfarb, Martha. 1988. "Heavenly Ascent and the Relationship of the Apocalypses and the Hekhalot Literature," Hebrew Union College Annual 59: 73-100.
- . 1993. Ascent to Heaven in Jewish and Christian Apocalypses. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hurtado, L. W. 2000. "Religious Experience and Religious Innovation in the New Testament," Journal of Religion 80: 183-205.
- Janowitz, Naomi. 1989. The Poetics of Ascent: Theories of Language in a Rabbinic Ascent Text. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Johnson, Timothy Luke. 1998. Religious Experience in Earliest Christianity: A Missing Dimension in New Testament Studies. Minneapolis: Fortress.
- Jonas, H. 1969. "Myth and Mysticism: A Study of Objectivization and Interiorization in Religious Thought," Journal of Religion 49 (4): 315-329.
- Kanagaraj, Jey J. 1998. "Mysticism" in the Gospel of John: An Inquiry into Its Background. Journal of the Study of the New Testament Supplement 158. Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press.
- Katz, Steven K. 1978. "Language, Epistemology, and Mysticism." In Mysticism and Philosophical Analysis, edited by Steven K. Katz, 22-74. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kenney, J. P. 1997. "Mysticism and Contemplation in the Enneads," American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly 71 (3): 315-337.
- Kerényi, Carl. 1976. Dionysus: Archetypal Image of Indestructible Life, translated by Ralph Manheim. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Lesses, Rebecca Macy. 1988. Ritual Practices to Gain Power: Angels, Incantations, and Revelation in Early Jewish Mysticism. Harrisburg, PA: Trinity Press.
- Billa, Salvatore R. C. 1971. Clement of Alexandria: A Study in Christian Platonism and Gnosticism. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Louth, Andrew. 1981. Origins of the Christian Mystical Tradition: From Plato to Denys. Oxford: Clarendon.
- Majercik, R. 1995. "Plotinus and Greek Mysticism." In Mysticism and the Mystical Experience

- Mastrocinque, Attilio. 2005. From Jewish Magic to Gnosticism. Studies and Texts in Antiquity and Christianity 24. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- McGinn, Bernard. 1992. The Foundations of Mysticism: Origins to the Fifth Century. New York: Crossroad-Herder.
- Meijer, P. 1992. Plotinus on the Good or the One (Enneads VI.9): an Analytical Commentary.

 Amsterdam: Gieben.
- Meyer, Marvin. 1987. The Ancient Mysteries: A Sourcebook. San Francisco: Harper,
- Meyer, Marvin, and Richard Smith, eds. 1994. Ancient Christian Magic: Coptic Texts of Ritual Power. San Francisco: Harper.
- Morray-Jones, Christopher. 1992. "Transformational Mysticism in the Apocalyptic-Merkavah Tradition," *Journal of Jewish Studies* 43: 1–31.
- . 1993a. "Paradise Revisited (2 Cor 12:1-2): The Jewish Mystical Background of Paul's Apostolate, Part 1: The Jewish Sources," Harvard Theological Review 86: 177-217.
- ——. 2002. A Transparent Illusion: The Dangerous Vision of Water in Hekhalot Mysticism, A Source-Critical and Tradition-Historical Inquiry. Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 59. Leiden: Brill.
- _____. 2006. "The Temple Within." In DeConick (2006), 145-178.
- Mylonas, George E. 1969. Eleusis and the Eleusinian Mysteries. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Newsom, Carol A. 1985. Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice: A Critical Edition. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Odeberg, Hugo. 1973. 3 Enoch or The Hebrew Book of Enoch. Jersey City, NJ: KTAV Publishing House.
- ______. 1974. The Fourth Gospel. Amsterdam: Grüner.
- Orlov, Andrei A. 2005. *The Enoch-Metatron Tradition*. Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism 107. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- ——. 2007. From Apocalypticism to Merkavah Mysticism: Studies in the Slavonic Pseudepigrapha. Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism 114. Leiden: Brill.
- Popovic, Mladen. 2007. Reading the Human Body, Physiognomics and Astrology in the Dead Sea Scrolls and Hellenistic-Early Roman Period Judaism. Leiden: Brill.
- Proudfoot, Wayne. 1985. Religious Experience. Berkeley: University of California.
- Quispel, Gilles. 1980. "Ezekiel 1:26 in Jewish Mysticism and Gnosis," Vigiliae Christianae
- Reitzenstein, Richard. 1978. Hellenistic Mystery-Religions: Their Basic Ideas and Significance, translated by John E. Steely. Pittsburg: Pickwick.
- Rist, J. M. 1964. Eros and Psyche: Studies in Plato, Plotinus, and Origen. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Roberts, Colin H. 1979. Manuscript, Society and Belief in Early Christian Egypt. London: Oxford University Press.
- Robinson. Iames M., ed. 1988. The Nag Hammadi Library in English. San Francisco: Harper.

- Rowland, Christopher. 1979. "The Visions of God in Apocalyptic Literature," *Journal for the Study of Judaism* 19: 145-150.
- . 1980. "The Vision of the Risen Christ in Rev. 1:13ff: The Debt of Early Christology to an Aspect of Jewish Angelology," Journal of Theological Studies 31: 1-11.
- -----. 1982. The Open Heaven: A Study of Apocalyptic Judaism and Early Christianity. New York: Crossroad.
- Rowland, Christopher, with Patricia Gibbons and Vicente Dobroruka. 2006. "Visionary Experience in Ancient Judaism and Christianity." In DeConick (2006), 41–56.
- Rowland, Christopher, and Christopher Morray-Jones. 2009. The Mystery of God: Early Jewish Mysticism and the New Testament. Leiden: Brill.
- Salaman, Clement, Dorine van Oyen, William D. Wharton, and Jean-Pierre Mahé, eds. 2000. The Way of Hermes. Rochester: Inner Traditions.
- Sanders, Seth. 2006. "Performative Exegesis." In DeConick (2006), 57-79.
- Schäfer, Peter. 1984. "New Testament and Hekhalot Literature: The Journey into Heaven in Paul and in Merkavah Mysticism," *Journal for Jewish Studies* 35: 19–35.
- ------ . 1992. The Hidden and Manifest God: Some Major Themes in Early Jewish Mysticism. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- ------. 2006. "Communion with Angels." In Wege mystischer Gotteserfahrung: Judentum, Christentum und Islam. 37–66. München: Oldenbourg.
- . 2009. The Origins of Jewish Mysticism. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- Schiffman, L. 1982. "Merkavah Speculation at Qumran." In Mystics, Philosophers and Politicians, edited by J. Reinharz and D. Swetschinski, 14-47. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Scholem, Gershom G. 1955. Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism. London: Thames and Hudson.
- . 1960. Jewish Gnosticism, Merkabah Mysticism, and Talmudic Tradition. New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America.
- Schweitzer, Albert. 1998. *The Mysticism of Paul the Apostle*, translated by William Montgomery. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Scott, Walter, ed. 1993. Hermetica. Boston: Shambhala.
- Segal, Alan F. 1980. "Heavenly Ascent in Hellenistic Judaism, Early Christianity and Their Environment," Aufstieg und Niedergang der Roemischen Welt II (23.2): 1333–1394.
- . 1981. "Hellenistic Magic: Some Questions of Definition." In Studies in Gnosticism and Hellenistic Religions, edited by Roelof van den Broek and M. J. Vermaseren, 349–375. Leiden: Brill.
- 1990. Paul the Convert: The Apostolate and Apostasy of Saul the Pharisee. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- n DeConick (2006), 27-40.
- Smith, Morton. 1963. "Observations on Hekhalot Rabbati." In *Biblical and Other Studies*, edited by Alexander Altmann, 142–160. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- . 1968. "On the Shape of God and the Humanity of Gentiles." In Religions in Antiquity, Essays in Memory of Erwin Ramsdell Goodenough. Edited by J. Neusner. Supplements to Numen (SHR) 14, 315–326. Leiden: Brill.

- . 1981. "Ascent to the Heavens and the Beginning of Christianity," Eranos-Jahrbuch 50: 403-429.
- _____. 1990. "Ascent to the Heavens and Deification in 4QMa." In Archeology and History: The New York University Conference in Memory of Yigael Yadin, edited by Lawrence H. Schiffman. Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha Series 8, pp. 181-188. Sheffield: ISOT Press.
- Stone, Michael E. 1976. "Lists of Revealed Things in the Apocalyptic Literature." In Magnalia Dei: The Mighty Acts of God, edited by Frank Moore Cross, Werner E. Lemke, and Patrick D. Miller Jr., 414–451. Garden City, NJ: Doubleday.
- Stroumsa, Guy G. 1996. Hidden Wisdom: Esoteric Traditions and the Roots of Christian Mysticism. Leiden: Brill.
- Strugnell, J. 1960. "The Angelic Liturgy." In Supplements to Vetus Testamentum 7, 318–345. Leiden: Brill.
- Stuckrad, Kocku von. 2000a. Das Ringen um die Astrologie: Jüdische und christliche Beiträge zum antiken Zeitverständnis. Berlin: de Gruyter.
- _____. 2000b. "Jewish and Christian Astrology in Late Antiquity—A New Approach," Numen 47: 1-40.
- Swartz, Michael D. 1996. Scholastic Magic: Ritual and Revelation in Early Jewish Mysticism. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Tabbernee, William. 2007. Fake Prophecy and Polluted Sacraments: Ecclesiastical and Imperial Reactions to Montanism. Vigiliae Christianae Supplement 84. Leiden: Brill.
- Tabor, James. 1986. Things Unutterable: Paul's Ascent to Paradise in its Greco-Roman, Judaic, and Early Christian Contexts. New York: University Press of America.
- Thesleff, H. 1980. "Notes on Unio Mystica in Plotinus," Arctos [Acta Philologica Fennica] 14; 101-104.
- Trachtenberg, Joshua. 1974. Jewish Magic and Superstition: A Study in Folk Religion. New York: Atheneum.
- Trigg, Joseph Wilson. 1983. Origen: The Bible and Philosophy in the Third-Century Church. Atlanta: John Knox.
- Underhill, Evelyn. 1911/1977. Mysticism: A Study in the Nature and Development of Man's Spiritual Consciousness. London: Methuen and Company.
- Ulansey, David. 1989. The Origins of the Mithraic Mysteries: Cosmology and Salvation in the Ancient World. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wallis, R. T. 1976. "NOUS as Experience." In The Significance of Neoplatonism, edited by R. B. Harris, 121-153. Norfolk: International Society for Neoplatonic Studies.
- ______. 1986. "The Spiritual Importance of Not Knowing." In Classical Mediterranean Spirituality: Egyptian, Greek, Roman, edited by A. H. Armstrong, 460-480. New York: Crossroad.
- Winston, David, ed. 1981. Philo of Alexandria: The Contemplative Life, the Giants, and Selections. Ramsey, NJ: Paulist Press.
- ———. 1982. "Was Philo a Mystic?" In Studies in Jewish Mysticism, Proceedings of Regional Conferences Held at the University of California, Los Angeles and McGill University in April, 1978, edited by Joseph Dan and F. Talmage, 15-39. Cambridge, UK: Association for Jewish Studies.
- Witt, R. E. 1971. Isis in the Ancient World. New York: Cornell University Press.

Wolfson, Elliot. 1994a. "Mysticism and the Poetic-Liturgical Compositions from Qumran; A Response to Bilhah Nitzan," Jewish Quarterly Review 85: 185-202.

Mysticism Before Mysticism

- -----. 1994b. Through a Speculum that Shines: Vision and Imagination in Medieval Jewish Mysticism. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University.
- . 2003. "Seven Mysteries of Knowledge: Qumran E/sotericism Recovered." In The Idea of Biblical Interpretation: Essays in Honor of James L. Kugel, edited by Hindy Najman and Judith H. Newman, 177-215. Leiden: Brill.
- 2007. "Inscribed in the Book of the Living: Gospel of Truth and Jewish Christology," Journal for the Study of Judaism 38: 234-271.